Genetic variation in two endangered Acrocephalus species compared to a widespread congener: estimates based on functional and random loci

Hansson, Bengt; Richardson, David

Published in:
Animal Conservation

DOI:
10.1017/S1367943004001878

2005

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
Genetic variation in two endangered *Acrocephalus* species compared to a widespread congener: estimates based on functional and random loci

Bengt Hansson\(^1,2,\dagger\) and David S. Richardson\(^1,3\)

\(^1\) Department of Animal Ecology, Lund University, Ecology Building, S-223 62 Lund, Sweden
\(^2\) Institute of Evolutionary Biology, School of Biological Sciences, University of Edinburgh, West Mains Road, Edinburgh EH9 3JT, UK
\(^3\) Centre for Ecology, Evolution and Conservation, Biological Sciences, University of East Anglia, Norwich NR4 7TJ, UK

(Received 29 October 2003; resubmitted 3 March 2004; accepted 22 July 2004)

Abstract

Substantial genetic variation is hypothesised to be necessary for the long-term survival of species. Therefore, a major aim in conservation is to maintain and restore variation in small and endangered populations. However, in most populations the amount of genetic variation and, thus, the potential threats posed by limited variation are unknown. In the present study, we assess genetic variation, both at 10 microsatellite loci and at the major histocompatibility complex (MHC), in three closely related *Acrocephalus* warbler species with contrasting demographies. We found that the recently bottlenecked, island endemic, Seychelles warbler (*A. sechellensis*; SW) has substantially reduced microsatellite and MHC diversity compared to the widespread great reed warbler (*A. arundinaceus*; GR W). In contrast, another endangered species with a small breeding range, the Basra reed warbler (*A. griseldis*; BR W), harboured as much variation as did the GR W. This suggests that significant genetic variation and, therefore, adaptive potential, remains in the BR W – a situation that should hold as long as its habitat and numbers are maintained. Our study is one of the first to assess genetic variation at both ‘non-critical’ microsatellite markers and ‘critical’ MHC loci within endangered species. The two types of loci provided a similar picture of the genetic variation in the species we studied, but this has not been the case in studies of some other species. Using a combination of specific functional loci and genome-wide random markers appears to be the best way to assess the threat posed by reduced genetic diversity.

INTRODUCTION

Substantial genetic variation is generally hypothesised to be necessary for the long-term survival of populations and species (Frankham, Ballou & Briscoe, 2002). When such variation is present, populations are thought to be better able to adapt to future environmental changes and cope with novel pathogens. Furthermore, genetically depauperate populations may suffer from inbreeding depression, which can contribute towards driving populations extinct (Saccheri *et al*., 1998; Westemeier *et al*., 1998; Madsen *et al*., 1999). Admittedly, there are studies showing that some populations manage to survive over long periods of time despite low levels of genetic variation (Groombridge *et al*., 2000; Visscher *et al*., 2001). Nevertheless, the long-term risks posed by low genetic variation have made the management and restoration of genetic variation a major aim in conservation (Frankham *et al*., 2002).

Small populations are predicted to lose genetic variation due to genetic drift (Nei, Maruyama & Chakraborty, 1975; Chakraborty & Nei, 1977; Wright, 1977; Lande, 1988). In populations that fluctuate over time, the loss of genetic variation accelerates during pronounced and prolonged bottlenecks. The amount of genetic variation is also affected by other parameters, such as selection. For expressed genes, the presence of balancing selection, or negative frequency-dependent selection, will counteract drift-dependent loss of genetic variation, whereas strong directional selection will erode variation by pushing advantageous gene variants to fixation (Hughes & Yeager, 1998; Lynch & Walsh, 1998). The complexity of these demographic and selective processes makes it difficult to predict the degree of genetic variation in most populations and species. Even the basic prediction that very small and restricted populations will have lower levels of genetic variation than large ones (Frankham, 1996) has sometimes been refuted. In studies that have contrasted the amount of genetic variation in endangered and widespread congeners, some have found comparatively low levels of genetic variation in the rare species (e.g. Godt, Walker & Hamrick, 1997; Groombridge *et al*., 2000; Ujvari *et al*., 2002), whereas others have found similar levels (e.g.
Lewis & Crawford, 1995; Ge et al., 1999; Madsen et al., 2000).

The fact that some studies find the expected association between population size and genetic variation while others do not, may be due to the choice of loci used to assess genetic variation (Frankham et al., 2002). This is demonstrated clearly in studies of single data sets analysed using multiple types of loci (Yan et al., 1999; Madsen et al., 2000) and is likely to reflect the different mutational-drift equilibria and patterns of selection at different loci (Frankham, 1996; Hedrick, 1999; Frankham et al., 2002). Consequently, care should be taken over selecting which loci to base assessments of diversity upon, especially when the results may have important ramifications for the conservation of a species (Reed & Frankham, 2001, 2003; van Tienderen et al., 2002).

The endemic Seychelles warbler (Acrocephalus sechellensis; SW) was pushed to the verge of extinction by anthropogenic disturbance and in the 1960s less than 30 individuals remained on a single island (Crook, 1960). Careful management of the species and its habitat has restored the SW population to a total of ca. 2000 birds on four islands (Komdeur, 1994, 2003; Richardson, 2001). The Basra reed warbler (A. griseldis; BR W) is restricted to wetlands within a limited area of southern Iraq and Kuwait (Cramp, 1992). Information on the BRW is scarce (Cramp 1992; Pearson & Backhurst, 1988; Tyler et al., 1997), but the most up-to-date source estimates its population size at a few thousand pairs (BirdLife International; http://www.birdlife.net/print.html). In contrast to the aforementioned rare species, the great reed warbler (A. arundinaceus; GRW) breeds over large parts of Eurasia (Catchpole, Leisler & Winkler, 1985; Cramp, 1992; Hansson, Gavrilo & Gavrilo, 2003), with population estimates of over one million pairs (Cramp, 1992; Hagemeijer & Blair, 1997).

In the present study, we compare the genetic variation of these three closely related species of Acrocephalus. We aim to evaluate the correspondence between population size and genetic variation in the species and to determine the genetic status of the endangered BRWs and SWs. We assess genetic variation at random and functional loci by analysing both non-coding microsatellite markers (Jarne & Lagoda, 1996) and coding loci in the major histocompatibility complex (MHC) – an area involved in the adaptive immune system of vertebrates (Hughes & Yeager, 1998; Hess & Edwards, 2002). This combination of loci allows us to obtain relevant estimates of the genetic variation of these species (Reed & Frankham, 2001, 2003; van Tienderen et al., 2002).

METHODS

Study species and general methods

The three species included in the present study are closely related and, in phylogenies based on variation at the mitochondrial cytochrome b gene, cluster together with the other relatively large and unstreaked Acrocephalus spp. (e.g. A. stentoreus and A. gracilirostis; Helbig & Seibold, 1999). The mitochondrial sequence difference is about 10% for the three species-pairs (GRW versus BRW = 9.7%; GRW versus SW = 8.5%; BRW versus SW = 10.5%; Helbig & Seibold, 1999).

The GRW breeds in the reed–water interface of wetlands over large parts of Europe and Asia (Fig. 1;
Catchpole et al., 1985; Cramp, 1992; Hansson et al., 2003) but overwinters in sub-Saharan Africa (Bensch et al., 1991; Cramp, 1992). Two subspecies are recognised, *A. a. arundinaceus* in the western part of the range (Europe) and *A. a. zarudnyi* in the eastern part (Asia), respectively (Cramp, 1992). The 22 individuals in the present study were captured using mist-nests at a stopover site at Malamfatori, close to Lake Chad in north eastern Nigeria, during the birds’ migration in August–November 2000 (see Fig. 1; Ottosson, Barlein & Hjort, 2002). These GRWs belonged to the western sub-species *A. a. arundinaceus* and are expected to originate from many different European populations, because (1) the stopover site is along a general migration route for European GRWs as suggested by ringing recoveries and censuses (Bensch et al., 1991; Cramp, 1992; Ottosson et al., 2002) and (2) samples were collected throughout the migratory period. Thus, the sample of *A. a. arundinaceus* should contain little bias with regard to the population sub-structuring known to occur within Europe (Bensch & Hansson, 2001; Richardson, Burke & Komdeur, 2002). These GRWs were expected to originate from many different European populations, because (1) the stopover site is along a general migration route for European GRWs as suggested by ringing recoveries and censuses (Bensch et al., 1991; Cramp, 1992; Ottosson et al., 2002) and (2) samples were collected throughout the migratory period. Thus, the sample of *A. a. arundinaceus* should contain little bias with regard to the population sub-structuring known to occur within Europe (Bensch & Hansson, 2001; Richardson, Burke & Komdeur, 2002).

Migrating GR W and BR W are easily separated from each other and from all other *A. a. arundinaceus* populations. The species migrates to central eastern Africa (Pearson & Backhurst, 1988; Cramp, 1992; Tyler et al., 1997) and during the last three decades about 60 (range 3–196) BRWs have been captured annually at Ngulia Ringing Station, Tsavo West National Park, south eastern Kenya (Pearson & Backhurst, 1988; G. Backhurst, pers. com.; Fig. 1). Of the birds included in the present study, five were examined at Ngulia in November–December 1990 and 17 in November–December 1998. Migrating GRW and BRW are easily separated from each other and from all other *Acrocephalus* spp. by means of a few morphological measurements (length of bill, head, wing and tail, and body mass: Pearson & Backhurst, 1988; Cramp, 1992; Hansson et al., 2003).

The SW is sedentary and endemic to evergreen forests on the Seychelles islands (Komdeur, 1992). Between 1959 and 1968, this species went through a severe genetic bottleneck with only 26–29 birds remaining on the island of Cousin (Crook, 1960). Since then the population has increased to approximately 2000 individuals (Richardson et al., 2002) and is likely to be a much better estimate of the species’ population increase and, on the basis of pedigree and molecular data, are not close relatives (Richardson & Westerdahl, 2003; Westerdahl et al., 2003). We chose the exon 3 because it encodes the peptide-binding region of the MHC class I genes and, therefore, is crucial for antigen recognition and adaptive immunity (Hughes & Yeager, 1998). The exon 3 consists of 274 base-pairs (bp), of which we amplified 260 bp (Westerdahl et al., 1999, 2003).

The PCR products were separated using denaturing acrylamide/bisacrylamide gels following the denaturant gradient gel electrophoresis technique (DGGE; for details see Richardson & Westerdahl, 2003; Westerdahl et al., 2003). Gels were stained with SYBR gold (Molecular Probes) and the alleles were visualised in a FluorImage SI (Molecular Dynamics Inc.). The screening method is repeatable and gives an estimate of the MHC class I exon 3 variation within each individual. A similar method has been used when studying MHC polymorphism in three-spined stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*; Reusch et al., 2001; Wegner, Reusch & Kalbe, 2003). The primers were originally developed for use in the GRW, but amplify the same length and region of the exon 3 in the SW (as determined by sequence similarity; D.S.R., unpublished results). The method worked equally well on the BRW, as well as on the marsh warbler, and there is no reason to think that it is not amplifying the same exon 3 region in these closely related species.

Microsatellite analyses

We used the following procedure to select microsatellite loci. From a database of 50 microsatellite loci developed in the Seychelles warbler (Richardson et al., 2000), we selected 10 markers that were polymorphic in the marsh warbler, *A. palustris* (Richardson et al., 2000), an outgroup species (Helbig & Seibold, 1999). By selecting loci that were polymorphic in this species, we reduced the potential problems of amplification failure due to mutations at the primer sites (Primmer, Møller & Ellegren, 1996) and of low levels of polymorphism due to low mutation rates caused by few repeat units (Ellegren, Primmer & Sheldon, 1995), in the species for which the primers were not originally designed. Detailed information about the microsatellite loci, including specific PCR conditions, can be found in Richardson et al. (2000).

Amplified microsatellite alleles were separated using electrophoresis in acrylamide gels. Gels were scanned in a FluorImage SI (Molecular Dynamics Inc.) to visualise the fluorescence-labelled primers and polymerase chain reaction (PCR)-products. In every gel, two reference individuals (two GRWs) were run as size standards. B. H. scored all microsatellite gels. Allele frequencies, allele counts, heterozygosity calculations, estimates of null allele frequencies and tests of Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium were evaluated for each species separately using the program CERVUS 2.0 (Marshall et al., 1998).

MHC analyses

To study genetic variation at the MHC, we used motif-specific primer combinations that amplify exon 3 sequences from one or several genes in the class I gene complex (Westerdahl, Witzell & von Schantz, 1999; Richardson & Westerdahl, 2003; Westerdahl et al., 2003). We chose the exon 3 because it encodes the peptide-binding region of the MHC class I genes and, therefore, is crucial for antigen recognition and adaptive immunity (Hughes & Yeager, 1998). The exon 3 consists of 274 base-pairs (bp), of which we amplified 260 bp (Westerdahl et al., 1999, 2003).

The PCR products were separated using denaturing acrylamide/bisacrylamide gels following the denaturant gradient gel electrophoresis technique (DGGE; for details see Richardson & Westerdahl, 2003; Westerdahl et al., 2003). Gels were stained with SYBR gold (Molecular Probes) and the alleles were visualised in a FluorImage SI (Molecular Dynamics Inc.). The screening method is repeatable and gives an estimate of the MHC class I exon 3 variation within each individual. A similar method has been used when studying MHC polymorphism in three-spined stickleback (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*; Reusch et al., 2001; Wegner, Reusch & Kalbe, 2003). The primers were originally developed for use in the GRW, but amplify the same length and region of the exon 3 in the SW (as determined by sequence similarity; D.S.R., unpublished results). The method worked equally well on the BRW, as well as on the marsh warbler, and there is no reason to think that it is not amplifying the same exon 3 region in these closely related species.
Table 1. Number of alleles ($k$) and genotyped individuals ($N$), and expected and observed heterozygosity ($H_E$ and $H_O$, respectively), at 10 microsatellite loci in three warblers of the genus *Acrocephalus*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Locus</th>
<th>Great reed warbler</th>
<th>Basra reed warbler</th>
<th>Seychelles warbler</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$k$</td>
<td>$N$</td>
<td>$H_E$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase27</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase34</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase56</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ase58</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Individuals of the same species were run on the same gel so that bandsharing between adjacent dyads of individuals could be compared. Each individual was compared to the individual directly to the left of it on the gel. D.S.R. scored all MHC gels. The number of DGGE bands present in each individual was counted and a bandsharing coefficient between dyads was calculated as described by Bruford et al. (1998).

**Statistical analyses**

We used number of alleles and expected heterozygosity to measure microsatellite diversity in our analyses, because these two measures, although expected to be correlated, describe allelic data somewhat differently: number of alleles is affected by the presence of both common and rare alleles, whereas expected heterozygosity is influenced mainly by the allele frequencies of common alleles. These are two of the most commonly used measures to describe allelic diversity in population genetic studies (Frankham et al., 2002). Similarly, we used number of bands and bandsharing coefficient to measure MHC diversity. We analysed the data using two-tailed non-parametric tests: Wilcoxon signed rank tests (denoted $z$; see below) for the microsatellites because this allowed inter-specific tests paired for loci and Mann-Whitney $U$-test/Kruskal–Wallis tests (denoted $U$ and $H$, respectively; see below) for the MHC data because this allowed tests of non-normally distributed samples.

**RESULTS**

**Microsatellite loci**

The microsatellite primers amplified products in all species and almost all PCRs were successful (654 out of 660 PCRs; Table 1). The BRW was polymorphic at all 10 loci, whereas the GRW and the SW were polymorphic at 8 and 7 loci, respectively. For all species, and for all loci, observed heterozygosity was similar to expected heterozygosity (Table 1) and in the few cases where a test was possible, we found no significant deviation from Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium (BRW at Ase2, SW at Ase27: $\chi^2 \leq 0.06$, d.f. = 1, NS). Estimates of null allele frequency ranged between 0.20 (BRW at Ase8) and $-0.23$ (SW at Ase19).

The mean number of microsatellite alleles was substantially lower for the SW than for the other two species (GRW: $z = -0.93$, $n = 10$ loci, $P = 0.016$; BRW: $z = -2.67$, $n = 10$ loci, $P = 0.008$; see Fig. 2 for mean ± standard error (s.e.) number of alleles per locus). There was no significant difference in number of alleles between the GRW and the BRW ($z = -0.95$, $n = 10$ loci, $P = 0.34$). A Fisher combined test (Sokal & Rohlf, 1995)
of the $P$-values from the pair-wise species tests showed that the difference in number of alleles was significant on the level of all species ($S_1 = -2 \times \Sigma (\log_e(P_i)) = 20.1$, d.f. = 1, $P < 0.005$).

Slightly different patterns were found using expected heterozygosity (see Fig. 2 for mean ± s.e. of expected heterozygosity per locus). The tests showed that the heterozygosity of the BRW was significantly higher than that of the SW ($z = 2.60, n = 10$ loci, $P = 0.009$), but not significantly different from that of the GRW ($z = 1.78, n = 10$ loci, $P = 0.074$). Despite the relatively large numerical difference between the GRW and SW in expected heterozygosity, this difference was also non-significant ($z = 1.07, n = 10$ loci, $P = 0.29$). The variation in expected heterozygosity differed significantly on the level of all species ($S_1 = 17.1$, d.f. = 1, $P < 0.01$).

Our analyses are based on genotype data from 22 individuals of each species. To evaluate whether this sample size was large enough to estimate the number of alleles and expected heterozygosity, we plotted the numerical difference between the GRW and SW in expected heterozygosity, resulting in low power in these comparisons. That the BRW had more MHC alleles but still higher bandsharing than the GRW is intriguing. A possible explanation is that balancing selection, which appears to play a determinant role in MHC evolution (Hughes & Yeager, 1998; Hess & Edwards, 2002), is maintaining both the number and the diversity of MHC alleles in the BRW. Since all individuals from the BRW are from one population in a limited geographical area, they all face the same selection pressures maintaining the same combinations of MHC alleles, thus individuals can have a high number of alleles but still be similar to each other. In contrast, the GRW’s massive pan-European population has significant population sub-structure (Bensch & Hasselquist, 1999; Hansson et al., 2000; Hansson, 2003). Therefore, the same process, where similar selection pressures are occurring on all birds, is unlikely in GRWs and genetic differences between sub-populations may be represented in our data set.

Genetic variation in the SW was about half to one third of that of its congeners. This estimate is in line with previous data from this species (Komdeur, Kappe & van de Zande, 1998; Richardson & Westerdahl, 2003). Similar low levels of variation have been found in populations of some other endemic island species, species after approximately 10 genotyped individuals (Fig. 3).

### The MHC loci

MHC alleles were amplified in 65 out of the 66 individuals. The number of different alleles varied significantly between species ($H = 41.96, d.f. = 2, P < 0.001$), and was lowest in the SW and highest in the BRW (Fig. 2). When species-pairs were compared, the difference in number of MHC alleles was significant in all three pairwise comparisons (GRW versus BRW, $U_{21,22} = 66.00, P < 0.001$; GRW versus SW, $U_{21,22} = 61.00, P < 0.001$; BRW versus SW, $U_{22,22} = 5.50, P < 0.001$). Also, the bandsharing coefficients differed significantly between species ($H = 41.28, d.f. = 2, P < 0.001$; Fig. 2). Here, the BRW scored higher than the GRW ($U_{20,22} = 101.00, P = 0.004$), whereas the SW scored higher than both the other species (GRW, $U_{20,22} = 4.00, P < 0.001$; BRW, $U_{22,22} = 16.00, P < 0.001$).

### DISCUSSION

Our results show that the GRW and the BRW populations contain similar high levels of genetic variation, whereas the SW population is genetically less variable. This pattern was statistically true for the comparison of number of microsatellite alleles. For microsatellite heterozygosity, the analyses indicated that the GRW tended to be less heterozygous than the BRW and although the SW appeared to have lower levels than the GRW, this difference was not significant. It is possible that the few monomorphic loci in the GRW and the SW caused large variation in the heterozygosity parameter, resulting in low power in these comparisons. That the BRW had more MHC alleles but still higher bandsharing than the GRW is intriguing. A possible explanation is that balancing selection, which appears to play a determinant role in MHC evolution (Hughes & Yeager, 1998; Hess & Edwards, 2002), is maintaining both the number and the diversity of MHC alleles in the BRW. Since all individuals from the BRW are from one population in a limited geographical area, they all face the same selection pressures maintaining the same combinations of MHC alleles, thus individuals can have a high number of alleles but still be similar to each other. In contrast, the GRW’s massive pan-European population has significant population sub-structure (Bensch & Hasselquist, 1999; Hansson et al., 2000; Hansson, 2003). Therefore, the same process, where similar selection pressures are occurring on all birds, is unlikely in GRWs and genetic differences between sub-populations may be represented in our data set.

Genetic variation in the SW was about half to one third of that of its congeners. This estimate is in line with previous data from this species (Komdeur, Kappe & van de Zande, 1998; Richardson & Westerdahl, 2003). Similar low levels of variation have been found in populations of some other endemic island species,
for example, Californian channel island foxes, *Urocyn littoralis* (Gilbert *et al.*, 1990), Laysan finch, *Telespizita cantans* (Tarr, Conant & Fleischer, 1998), Mariana crow, *Corvus kubaryi* (Tarr & Fleischer, 1999) and Seychelles white-eye, *Zosterops modestus* (Rocamora & Richardson, 2003; see also studies reviewed therein). It is plausible that most of the genetic variation was depleted during the recent bottleneck that the SW went through (Komdeur *et al.*, 1998; Richardson & Westerdahl, 2003), but also earlier undocumented bottlenecks are very likely to have occurred in the isolated and fragmented island habitat provided by the Seychelles islands.

The substantial genetic variation at both microsatellites and MHC found in the BRW is important as this suggests that the species retains biodiversity and high adaptive potential (c.f. Hughes & Yeager, 1998; Hess & Edwards, 2002; Reed & Frankham, 2003). This positive situation should hold as long as the habitat, and thus the population, remains intact. Unfortunately, the Mesopotamian marshes where the species breeds have been almost entirely drained during the last decade and numbers are currently declining (see BirdLife International, http://www.birdlife.net/print.html). If this decline continues, the expression of genetic load could have disastrous reproductive consequences for this species (c.f. Saccheri *et al.*, 1998; Westemeier *et al.*, 1998; Madsen *et al.*, 1999). Updated population estimates and data on habitat utilisation at the breeding quarters are necessary to assess the long-term survival status of the BRW and new genetic surveys on this species may be required in the near future.

The results from our study indicate that regardless of which loci are used, and contrary to predictions (Frankham, 1996), genetic variation does not always correlate strongly with population size. Other studies on a range of species have shown similar results (e.g. Lewis & Crawford, 1995; Ge *et al.*, 1999; Madsen *et al.*, 2000). This lack of correlation may be a result of the complicated processes involved in determining genetic variation at specific loci (see Introduction, above), or because our sample of migrating GRWs represented populations from only a part of the European breeding range (thus, should be associated with a somewhat smaller population size; see Methods, above). However, in our study the fact that the widely distributed GRW showed no more genetic variation than the much rarer BRW, could indicate that the current GRW population size provides a very poor estimate of the species’ long-term effective population size, which is the relevant parameter in this context (Wright, 1977; Lande, 1988). In line with this reasoning, mitochondrial DNA analyses show that the long-term effective population size of the GRW is in fact only in the order of 1% of the current population size (Bensch & Hasselquist, 1999). Alternatively, it might be suggested that ongoing hybridisation and gene flow between the BRW and other species, e.g. the GRW, may have caused the relatively high level of variation in the BRW. Indeed, related *Acrocephalus* sp. may occasionally hybridise (Hansson *et al.*, 2003: Hansson, Roggeman & De Smet, 2004; c.f. Grant & Grant 1992). However, this is not a likely explanation for our results. The mitochondrial sequence divergence between BRWs and GRWs is about 10% (Helbig & Seibold, 1999), which implies that they have been separated for a very long period of time. Moreover, these two species had completely non-overlapping microsatellite allele frequencies at locus Ase12 and very different allele frequency distributions at most other loci (data not shown), which suggest that there is no present gene flow between them.

In our study the ‘critical’ MHC loci and the ‘non-critical’ microsatellite markers provide a similar picture of genetic variation in the species, i.e. diversity is similar in the GRW and the BRW but reduced in the SW. While our results from different types of loci support each other, we know that this is not always the case (e.g. Yan *et al.*, 1999; Madsen *et al.*, 2000). To date, most biodiversity studies have focused on allozymes or non-coding genetic markers (for a review, see Frankham *et al.*, 2002). However, recent studies have criticised the use of such markers as they may not reflect the variation that is important to the fitness of the species in question (Reed & Frankham, 2001; van Tienderen *et al.*, 2002; Bekessy *et al.*, 2003; but see Reed & Frankham, 2003). Still, as pointed out by van Tienderen *et al.* (2002), replacing neutral markers, which cover a large part of the genome, with markers that only target a small subset of genes, is risky when assessing the biodiversity of endangered species, especially if the threat to the species is from genome-wide inbreeding depression. Using a combination of genome-wide neutral markers and specific ‘critical’ loci (chosen to measure variability at ecologically important traits) appears to be the safest way to assess the threat posed by reduced genetic diversity in a species.

Acknowledgements

We thank U. Ottosson, J. Waldenström and the Ottenby Birds Observatory for providing samples from Nigeria; G. Backhurst, D. Hasselquist, D. Pearson, L. R˚aberg, M. Stjernman and the Ngulia Ringing Group for providing samples and/or assisting B.H. when collecting samples in Tsavo West NP; and Nature Seychelles for kindly allowing D.S.R. to work on Cousin island. The Department of Environment and the Seychelles Bureau of Standards gave permission for fieldwork and sampling of the SW. We are grateful to B. Ujvari, T. Madsen and M. Olsson for sharing unpublished results and to three referees for useful comments. The study was supported by a postdoctoral fellowship from the Swedish Research Council and STINT to B.H., a Marie Curie fellowship to D.S.R. (HPMF-CT-2000-01074) and grants from the Kungliga Fysiografiska Sällskapet (Berggrens Foundation) and the Royal Swedish Academy of Science (Ahlstrand and Hierta-Retzius Foundations) to B.H.

REFERENCES


