Cosmos and Conquest: Precursors of Iberian Overseas Expansion, c. 1500-1600

Bartelson, Jens

2019

Document Version:
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
Unless other specific re-use rights are stated the following general rights apply:
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.
• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Read more about Creative commons licenses: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
Cosmos and Conquest: Precursors of Iberian Overseas Expansion, c. 1500-1600

Jens Bartelson
STANCE is a six-year research program at the Department of Political Science at Lund University, Sweden. The program, consisting of several separate but connected research projects, aims to answer the question of how state-making and the international system co-evolved in the long 19th century (1789-1914) and beyond. The program is constructed around three research themes: (1) How did the different dimensions of state-making evolve? What actors and organized interests supported or put up resistance to these processes?; (2) How were these dimensions of state-making affected by geopolitical competition, warfare and the diffusion of novel political technologies?; and (3) What were the consequences for the international system, both with respect to the type of state that emerged and what entities were granted membership in the state system?

The program aims to bridge the gaps between comparative politics and IR, as well as those between the study of political thought and positive empirical political science. The research has been made possible by the Bank of Sweden Tercentenary Foundation (Riksbankens Jubileumsfond). Visit the research program’s website at www.stanceatlund.org

Please address comments and/or queries for information to:

Email address: info@stanceatlund.org
Mailing address: STANCE
Department of Political Science
Lund University
Box 52, SE-221 00 Lund, Sweden

In Series 2016:
1. “STATE CAPACITY AS POWER: A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK”, Johannes Lindvall and Jan Teorell
3. “STEPPE STATE MAKING”, Martin Hall
4. “WAR, PERFORMANCE AND THE SURVIVAL OF FOREIGN MINISTERS”, Hanna Bäck, Jan Teorell, and Alexander von Hagen-Jamar
5. “THE NATION-STATE AS FAILURE: NATIONALISM AND MOBILITY, IN INDIA AND ELSEWHERE”, Erik Ringmar
6. “CABINETS, PRIME MINISTERS, AND CORRUPTION. A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF PARLIAMENTARY GOVERNMENTS”, Hanna Bäck, Staffan Lindberg, and Jan Teorell
7. “SOCIAL POLICY AND MIGRATION POLICY IN THE LONG NINETEENTH CENTURY”, Sara Kalm and Johannes Lindvall
8. “FROM AN INCLUSIVE TO AN EXCLUSIVE INTERNATIONAL ORDER: MEMBERSHIP OF INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS FROM THE 19TH TO THE 20TH CENTURY”, Ellen Ravndal
UNIFIED INDIA”, Ted Svensson
10. “REPUBLICA SRPSKA – THE BECOMING OF A STATE”, Annika Björkdahl
11. “MILITARY RIVALRIES, ALLIANCES AND TAXATION: THE INTERNATIONAL
ORIGINS OF MODERN FISCAL CONTRACTS”, Agustín Goenaga and Alexander
von Hagen-Jamar

In Series 2017

1. “THE SOCIAL ORIGINS OF STATE CAPACITY: ORGANIZATIONS,
INSTITUTIONS AND LATE DEVELOPMENT”, Agustín Goenaga Orrego
2. “TECHNOLOGY AND POLITICS: A RESEARCH AGENDA”, Johannes Lindvall
3. “RULES OF RECOGNITION: EXPLAINING DIPLOMATIC REPRESENTATION
IN THE LONG NINETEENTH CENTURY”, Jan Teorell
Svensson
5. “INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS, AUTHORITY AND THE FIRST
PERMANENT SECRETARIATS IN THE 19TH CENTURY”, Ellen Ravndal
‘BLACK BOX’ FOR SPAIN (1850-1915)”, Oriol Sabaté, Sergio Espuelas and Alfonso
Herranz-Loncán
7. “STATE MAKING AND SWEDISH POLITICS IN THE NORTH”, Martin Hall
8. “STANDARDIZING MOVEMENTS: THE INTERNATIONAL PASSPORT
CONFERENCES OF THE 1920S”, Sara Kalm
9. “PREPARING FOR WAR: DEMOCRATIC THREAT RESPONSIVENESS AND
MILITARY SPENDING IN THE LONG 19TH CENTURY”, Alexander von Hagen-
Jamar
10. “DOES FEMALE LEADERSHIP MATTER? AN ANALYSIS OF SWEDISH
FOREIGN MINISTERS AND THEIR PARLIAMENTARY SPEECHES 1955-2016”,
Hanna Bäck and Annika Björkdahl
11. “SOLVING THE DECIDER’S DILEMMA: SCAPEGOATS, FOREIGN AFFAIRES,
AND THE DURATION OF INTERSTATE WAR”, Alejandro Quiroz Flores, Hanna
Bäck, Alexander von Hagen-Jamar, and Jan Teorell

In Series 2018

1. “INTERNATIONAL ORDER, LANGUAGE GAMES AND THE EMERGENCE OF
CHINESE ‘SOVEREIGNTY’ CLAIMS IN THE SOUTH CHINA SEA, 1909-1947”,
Amanda J. Cheney
2. “EMPIRE AND STATE IN EARLY MODERN POLITICAL THOUGHT”, Jens Bartelson
3. “THE AMBIGUOUS EFFECTS OF DEMOCRACY ON BUREAUCRATIC QUALITY”, David Andersen and Agnes Cornell
4. “NOT BECOMING A STATE: THE ICELANDIC COMMONWEALTH FROM COLONIZATION TO NORWEGIAN SUZERAINTY”, Martin Hall
5. “POOR RELIEF AND INTERNAL MIGRATION: LESSONS FROM THE NINETEENTH CENTURY”, Sara Kalm and Johannes Lindvall
6. “WAR AND STATE CAPACITY IN THE LONG NINETEENTH CENTURY”, Agustín Goenaga, Oriol Sabaté and Jan Teorell
7. “RAILWAYS AND REFORM: HOW TRAINS STRENGTHENED THE NATION STATE”, Alexandra L. Cermeño, Kerstin Enflo and Johannes Lindvall

In Series 2019
1. “INCOME TAX PROGRESSIVITY AND WAR INFLATION DURING THE TWO WORLD WARS”, Sara Torregrosa-Hetland and Oriol Sabaté
2. “WHY IS TIBET PART OF CHINA? LANGUAGE-GAMES, TRANSLATION AND INTERNATIONAL ORDER TRANSFORMATION IN THE LONG NINETEENTH CENTURY”, Amanda Cheney
3. “ROME: REPUBLIC TO EMPIRE”, Martin Hall and Torbjørn Knutsen
6. “ROYAL IMPORT”, Klas Nilsson
7. “COSMOS AND CONQUEST: PRECURSORS OF IBERIAN OVERSEAS EXPANSION, c. 1500-1600”, Jens Bartelson

STANCE working papers are available in electronic format at www.stanceatlund.org

COPYRIGHT © 2019 by authors. All rights reserved.
Cosmos and Conquest: Precursors of Iberian Overseas Expansion, c. 1500-1600

Jens Bartelson
Professor in Political Science
Lund University
Introduction

How did Latin America come to be dominated by two weak polities on the fringe of Europe during the early modern period? As Gabriel Paquette has argued in a recent book, this was less due to any superiority on their behalf or of the wider civilization in which they partook, but rather the result of their employment of systematic violence which was then ‘embedded in the institutions they established overseas’; to the ‘efficacious forms of governance and finance’ which enabled them to ‘project and retain power across vast distances’, and finally, to the collaboration of creole elites to maintain and extend control of conquered territories. Assisted by a mighty army of microbes, the creation of overseas empire was propelled by geopolitical competition between European states, yet also constantly compromised by rivalries among their elites.1

But first you had to get there. The creation of overseas empires presupposed that there was something out there to conquer in the first place, since expanding into what one believed to be an empty space would have made little or no sense. It further presupposed that there was a way of getting there, getting over the seas so that this ‘out there’ quite literally becomes an overseas. And for this feat to be possible, the ocean must not be an unsurmountable abyss but had to be perceived as a navigable waterway, possible to master and traverse. Finally, the creation of overseas empires presupposed that there were ways of making sense of the peoples found on these foreign shores if only to obtain the control necessary for their subsequent subjugation. In short, overseas expansion and the creation of empires presupposed the possession of a range of intellectual resources that had not been available to the advocates of empire during antiquity and the middle ages. Crafted out of a myriad of sources – Greek, Roman, Jewish, Christian – these resources proved indispensable not only to discovery and conquest, but also to the justification of these activities to those who for various reasons doubted their viability and legitimacy.

Whilst the necessary intellectual resources might be available to us, there were certainly not so at the onset of overseas expansion.

---

Contemporary conceptions of empire were fashioned out of the Roman concept of *imperium* which mainly connoted *territorial* rule, however discontinuous those territories and heterogenous their populations, and made no references to the possibility of extending such *imperium* to other continents beyond the Euro-Asian landmass for the simple reason that their existence remained unknown or at least highly uncertain at this point in time.\(^2\) As Isidore of Seville had established long ago ‘the ocean is impassable to men, and those worlds which are beyond it are also unreachable.’\(^3\) Consequently, the early chroniclers of the Spanish crown had little to say about the possibility of overseas expansion but confined their visions of empire within the geographical limits handed down to them by Roman and Christian medieval sources.\(^4\) This made early modern Iberian empires different from their competitors at the time. The Ottoman and the Mughal empires both were mainly empires of land, and although the Ottomans had tried to control trade in the Indian Ocean, they were soon outcompeted by the Portuguese.\(^5\)

But when Tommaso Campanella published his *Della Monarchia di Spagna* in 1600, the aspiration to universal monarchy had become of a truly planetary scope, stretching far beyond the geographical limits of the Roman and Christian worlds.\(^6\) At this point, Iberian overseas empires had become premised on the mastery of the transcontinental waterways connecting the different parts of world in ways that transcended the territorial boundaries and geographical

---


limits of the ancient world. As the Spanish humanist Juan Vives noted in 1531, ‘t]he whole globe is opened up to the human race, so that no one is so ignorant of events as to think that the wanderings of the ancients...are to be compared with the journeys of these travellers.’ Hence the notion of an orbis terrarum had been abandoned in practice already before it was formally refuted by Copernicus in 1534, the impetus coming from the cartographical advances following the rediscovery Ptolemy’s Geography in the late fifteenth century.

These cartographical advances were to a large extent motivated by the relentless search for safer and cheaper trade routes to the East Indies. At the same moment as the Lopo Gonçalves first crossed the equator in 1473, Paolo dal Pozzo Toscanelli had written a letter to Fernão Martins, canon of the Lisbon cathedral, on the subject of possible circumnavigation: ‘You must not be surprised...if I call the parts where the spices are west, when they usually call them east, because to those sailing west, those parts are found by navigation on the underside of the earth. But if by land on the upper side, they will always be found to the east.’ Written in order to be comprehensible to the intended lay audience, the simplicity of these instructions contrasts nicely with the complexity of the task at hand. This task consisted of convincing the Portuguese elite of the validity of a new worldview which was at odds with the educated lore of the day and prompting members of this elite to act urgently upon this new knowledge. But when both Martins and king Alfonso V failed to

---

respond, a copy of the same letter was sent to a more entrepreneurial spirit in Genoa who was to obtain funding from the Spanish crown.\textsuperscript{12}

Some authors have emphasized the extent to which Iberian overseas expansion depended on new scientific and technological innovations. Without the innovations such as the caravel and the quadrant, the discoveries and conquests would not have been possible.\textsuperscript{13} But although these innovations greatly facilitated overseas expansion by bringing improved methods of navigation and warfare, the underlying worldview was all but scientific by any modern standards, lest the quest for overseas empire would have been very difficult to legitimize in contemporary terms. It therefore seems reasonable to argue that many of the categories and concepts associated with the rise of modern science owe more to projects of overseas expansion than the other way around.\textsuperscript{14}

Yet this raises the question of how the cosmological beliefs underwriting overseas expansion were used to justify such pursuits to contemporary Iberian elites. This is the topic of the present chapter. In the next section, I shall try to reconstruct those parts of this worldview that made overseas expansion look viable and legitimate. As I shall suggest, this worldview was still based on medieval and renaissance modes of knowledge rather than on any recognizably modern idea of science. In the second section, I shall describe how the same set of beliefs was used to make sense of the New World and its inhabitants and how the resulting knowledge was used to facilitate and legitimize their subjection to imperial rule.

Taming space

According to some historians, Iberian overseas expansion came with strong claims to novelty. Iberian scholars believed that they were

\textsuperscript{12} A copy of this letter was sent by Toscanelli to the young Cristobal Cólon. See Norbert Sumien, \textit{La Correspondence du Savant Florentin Paolo del Pozzo Toscanelli avec Christophe Colomb}, (Paris: Société d’éditions géographiques, maritimes et coloniales, 1927), 9ff.


\textsuperscript{14} See, for example, Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, \textit{Nature, Empire, and Nation: Explorations of the history of science in the Iberian world}. (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2006).
superseding the wisdom of the ancients and paving the way for a comprehensive revision of received views of both man and nature.\textsuperscript{15} Such claims to novelty abounded already in the aftermath of the discoveries and were closely associated with quests for universal empire. As Bodin argued in his \textit{Methodus} (1566), whereas the ancients had lived within the confines of the Mediterranean basin, his contemporaries ‘traverse the whole earth every year in frequent voyages and lead colonies into another world…[n]ot only has this discovery developed an abundant and profitable commerce…but also all men surprisingly work together in a world state, as if in one of the same city-state.’\textsuperscript{16} Similarly, both Abbé de Raynal and Adam Smith took the discoveries of the New World to mark the birth of the modern world. To Raynal, discovery and circumnavigation ‘gave rise to a revolution in the commerce, and in the power of nations, as well as in the manners, industry, and government of the whole world.’\textsuperscript{17} Similarly, to Smith, the ‘discovery of America, and that of a passage to the East Indies by the Cape of Good Hope, are the two greatest and most important events recorded in the history of mankind’ insofar as they inaugurated a new age of profitable trade and colonial exchange.\textsuperscript{18}

In retrospect these claims to novelty appear anachronistic and overstated to bolster national pride.\textsuperscript{19} For example, the heliocentric theory presented by Copernicus in \textit{De revolutionibus} (1543) did not find any immediate resonance among Iberian scholars since its consistent uptake would have entailed a rejection of the predominant geocentric worldview and thus put them at odds with ecclesiastical authorities.\textsuperscript{20} But still the Ptolemaic theory appeared insufficient for

\begin{flushleft}


the task at hand, since it said nothing about stars visible in the Southern hemisphere. As the Portuguese approached the equator on their explorations of the West African coast, the Pole Star could no longer serve as a reliable guide as it sank to the horizon only to eventually disappear from sight. This required new astronomical knowledge and the use of instruments such as the astrolabe for measuring the altitude of the sun in order to find the latitude of any given location. And as soon as mariners ventured outside the Mediterranean basin, medieval portolan charts became useless for navigation, prompting the Royal Cosmographer Pedro Nunes to write an elaborate defense of the plane chart (carta de marear) with its equidistant and parallel meridians as the only useful instrument of navigation for long distance transoceanic voyages.

Measuring latitude by means of an astrolabe in turn required the use of solar tables such those found in the Hajibur Hagadol by the Jewish astrologer Abraham Zacuto. These tables were translated into Portuguese by José Vizinho and published under the title Almanach Perpetuum (1496) and were used by Vasco da Gama on his first voyage to India in 1497 and by Pedro Alvares Cabral on the expedition that unintentionally landed him on the coast of Brazil in April 1500. Roughly contemporary -- but not necessarily reliable -- sources suggest that Zacuto was present to bid the former farewell on the beach of Restelo. Coupled with practical advice on how to determine the height of the sun, his solar tables were then used to compile influential manuals of navigation such as the Regimento de Munique (1509), the Regimento do Astrolábio e do Quadrante (1509) and the Regimento de Évora (1516), thereby effecting a transfer of practical

---

knowledge from astronomers to mariners. But the astrolabe, the lodestar, the quadrant, and the compass were not mere tools of navigation, but were also widely understood as instruments of imperial expansion in their own right. As Pedro Nunes maintained in 1537, the expansion of the Portuguese was made possible by the fact that ‘our seamen are well trained and equipped with instruments and rules of astronomy and geometry’. And as Camões had Vasco de Gama to say in *Os Lusiadas*, the discoveries of new lands were made possible by that ‘new and ingenious instrument the astrolabe.’

This confluence of intellectual and political concerns generated new ways of producing and organizing knowledge, centered on the heroic figure of the knight as cosmographer and his gathering of knowledge as a fresh way of extolling chivalric virtues.

These advances in navigation notwithstanding, transoceanic voyages had to be justified against the backdrop of still widely held beliefs according to which there were no ship routes or continents beyond the confines of the *orbis terrarum*. Moreover, overseas expansion had also to justified against the backdrop of emergent patriotic sentiments according to which the ancient lands of Lusitania and bonds of kinship ought to constitute the prime object of political allegiance. Hence, even in the most famous instance of celebration, a voice of skepticism was inserted if perhaps only for edifying purposes. Thus, at the very moment Vasco da Gama was about to depart for India, Camões had an old man complaining: ‘Oh, the folly of it, this craving for power, this thirsting after the vanity we call fame, this fraudulent pleasure known as honour that thrives on popular esteem...[y]ou allow the enemy to flourish at your gates while you go seek another at the other side of the world, at the price of depopulating and weakening this ancient kingdom and squandering

---

its resources." Camões could provisionally resolve this tension by drawing on an epic tradition which at least since Virgil had connected patriotic virtue with imperial expansion, but the sheer appearance of the Old Man of Restelo indicates that overseas expansion was still controversial.

Since overseas expansion was by no means an unproblematic undertaking, this leaves us with the difficulty of explaining how it was made intelligible and justifiable to all those courtiers, noblemen, clergymen, and scholars who were to become stakeholders and beneficiaries in this long and arduous process. Although overseas expansion presupposed an understanding of the world as one single space open to mastery and domination, this particular imperial imaginary could not be easily assembled out of the conceptual resources available to the erudite parts of the Iberian elite, since recent advances in astronomy were not widely disseminated at the onset of the discoveries and revived Roman visions of empire remained silent about the possibility of overseas expansion.

But knowledge of celestial bodies was not only necessary to determine location at sea, but these bodies were also invested with profound symbolical significance in age when astrology and astronomy were still inseparable intellectual enterprises. As Esguerra has argued, ‘[a]strology was part of the obvious mental landscape of every learned individual in the early modern world, regardless of religion and country of origin. Although prognostication was itself a contentious issue that raised all sorts of theological and political questions, the understanding that the stars affected behavior in the sublunary world was something everybody took for granted.’


According to the ancient tradition, the stars affected the composition of objects in the sublunary sphere through the four elements of earth, fire, air, and water, and human temperament through the balance of the bodily fluids blood, yellow bile, black bile, and phlegm. Coupled with Ptolemy’s division of the known world into three distinct regions, the stars were also believed to determine the climate and characteristics of each such region. Celestial influences thereby covered the course of natural and human history, so that ‘all occurrences from the flora of a district to the history of its inhabitants must be determined by the virtue of the presiding stars, and explained with reference to their influence.’

This confluence of natural and human history even made it possible for Bodin to take a shot at the Copernican theory, ‘since neither the motion of eccentric circles nor of the sun is in any way significant in the changes of empire…we shall have to judge that it pertains to those well-known conjunctions of the stars.’

Making the benefits of overseas expansion intelligible to lay audiences had to proceed from such established beliefs, giving rise to a literary genre that connected concerns of cosmography and navigation with more mundane pursuits. Books in this genre all bear more or less the same title, being variations of Reportorio de los tiempos and Reportorio dos tempos in Spanish and Portuguese respectively.

Intended for a broad audience, these books struggled to mediate between the geocentric worldview still sanctioned by ecclesiastical authorities and the emergent Copernican heliocentric one. A good example in this regard is Reportorio dos tempos, o mais copioso que até agora sahio a luz (1585) by André do Avelar. Inspired by Chronographia o reportorio de los tiempos (1550) by the his more famous Spanish colleague Jeronimó de Chaves, Avelar’s work reflects some fascinating commonalities of this genre. Among these was the consistent effort to turn temporal differences into spatial ones.

---

33 Bodin, Method for the Easy Comprehension of History, 234.
34 Cardoso and Martins, ‘Iberian Approaches to Astronomy in the Sixteenth Century’, 269.
35 For the relationship between these works, see da Adalgisa Botelho Costa, ‘O Reportorio dos Tempos de André do Avelar e A Astrologia em Portugal no Século XVI’, in Roberto de Andrade Martins, Liliana Al-Chueyr Pereira Martins, Cibelle Celestino Silva and Juliana Mesquita Hidalgo Ferreira (eds.), Filosofia e Historia Da Ciencia No Cone Sul: 3 Encontro, (Campinas: Associação de Filosofia e Historia Da Ciencia No Cone Sul, 2008), 1-7.
Starting out from Augustine’s tripartite classification of time into *aeternitas*, *aveum*, and *tempus*, Avelar begins by telling us that eternity is ‘a space that lacks principle, is without end, without cause and succession which is always present and enjoys permanence.’  

Having established that the lesser substrata of time are defined by their duration, Avelar goes on to compartmentalize temporality into days and nights and fractions thereof. While doing this, however, he makes a significant departure from Augustine insofar as he does not conceptualize *tempus* in terms of the experiences and expectations of the human mind, but with an unmistakable Aristotelian reference to the movement of heavenly bodies and their influence on earth. Planetary movements do not only determine the duration of days and nights, but also the proportion of bodily fluids and the corresponding tempers, so that while certain hours are likely to provoke melancholia, others may incite choleric or phlegmatic tempers, still others sanguine depending on location.

Having established an intricate series of correspondences between temporal categories through the movements of heavenly bodies, the change of seasons, the cycle of weeks and months, the chronologies of human age, the phases of world history, and the succession of kings and monarchies, Avelar proceeds to describe the geographical features of the known world. Since the discovery of the New World had prompted a revision of the worldview of the ancients, Avelar is led to posit that land and water together now together form one globe situated in the center of the universe, subdivided into regions with distinct climates affecting all forms of life there: the terraqueous globe of Copernicus is inserted into the center of what remained an essentially Ptolemaic universe. Consequently the ocean is no longer an impassable chasm, but a medium of connectivity whose usefulness to human beings hinges on their skill in harnessing the right winds and knowledge of planetary influences. Since navigating the oceans makes it necessary to know the position of the stars, Avelar offered advice how to locate the Pole Star and the Southern Cross with reference to the signs of the zodiac.

Not unlike his contemporary Giordano Bruno, Avelar fits the
commonplaces of early modern astronomy into the hermetic and
For this and other reasons, his \textit{Reportorio} was placed on the index in 1623 on account of heresy.

This chain of resemblances allowed Avelar to predict the
occurrences of different phenomena with reference to the signs of
nature. The strange and irregular behavior of cows, goats, chicken,
and bees foretells imminent changes of weather, and the more
dramatic these irregularities, the more the dramatic the ensuing
change. Outright weirdness is therefore to be expected from all farm
animals ahead of tempests and earthquakes, as much as a sure sign
of a coming plague is a sudden abundance of reptiles.\footnote{Avelar, \textit{Reportorio dos Tempos}, 110-135.} Comets are
harbingers of bad news in general, since they will corrupt the fruits
of the earth, bring sterility to beasts, and fire and violent outbursts
to humankind.\footnote{Avelar, \textit{Reportorio dos Tempos}, 139-140.} But knowledge of the heavenly bodies also made it
possible to know when it is best to plant wheat and wine, how to cope
with the unpleasant fallout of canicular days, and when to
phlebotomize or otherwise purge your body of undesirable fluids
depending on where you happened to be.\footnote{Avelar, \textit{Reportorio dos Tempos}, 144-155; 168-181.}

This permitted Avelar to make sense of a wide range of
phenomena with reference to the same body of astrological
knowledge. If you suffer bouts of melancholia in the dry winter
mornings of Coimbra, if you are overwhelmed with idleness in the
stewing summer days of Seville, if your sheep are displaying signs of
apprehension on a windy day in spring, or if your orange tree yields
less fruit than the autumn before, all of this can be properly
understood only if we take the heavenly bodies into consideration.
Avelar renders all these phenomena intelligible and subject to the
illusion of partial control by making the likelihood of their
occurrence entirely relative to position in time and place. But by
doing this, he assumes that temporal differences can be seamlessly
translated into spatial differences across the entire terraqueous
globe, so that the knowledge needed in order to harvest olives at the
right time is basically the same as the knowledge needed to set sail
for Salvador in the hope for a safe return with bountiful cargo to Lagos. Through an admittedly shaky employment of *modus ponens*, overseas expansion becomes hard to refuse for anyone excited by the promises of natural exuberance or invested in the smooth running of everyday agrarian life. But what happened when this kind knowledge was superimposed on the New World and the peoples found there?

**Taming Indians**

On February 29, 1504, Christopher Columbus had been stranded on Jamaica for six months. Although the natives had been initially forthcoming and provided Columbus and his crew with food and fresh water, as months passed they grew increasingly impatient with the newcomers to the point of halting the supplies. Columbus then summoned the local *Caciques* and let his interpreter tell them in no uncertain terms that the Christian God was very displeased with their conduct and that as a punishment the moon would rise that night ‘inflamed with wrath’. And as the moon rose the following evening, ‘with great howling and lamentation they came running from every direction to the ships, laden with provisions, praying the Admiral to intercede by all means with God on their behalf; that he might not visit his wrath upon them.’

In order to be able to perform this remarkable act of dissimulation Columbus had again consulted the solar tables by Zacuto to find a lunar eclipse to be imminent, which luckily could be weaponized in order to tame the natives. Although the veracity of this account is dubious – an ageing Fernando Colon had obvious an interest in rehabilitating the by now slightly tarnished reputation of his father – it nevertheless indicates the extent to which contemporaries believed that knowledge of what transpired in the heavens could be turned into power over other human beings on earth.

---

As several authors already have shown, the projection of power onto new transoceanic spaces effectively turned these into distinct places while constituting the different peoples found there into Others, vastly different from the Europeans. Yet for all their obvious merits, these works have not had much to say about how contemporary cosmological beliefs conditioned efforts to make sense of the customs and habits of the American Indians. Thus, in what follows, I shall describe how the mode of astrological reasoning popularized by books in the Reportorio genre also informed early accounts of the American Indians, and how these yielded strategies of rule characteristic of early Iberian empires. Here Portuguese sources remain silent for the simple reason that the Portuguese did not expand territorial control much beyond their fatorias during the early phases of empire. As the first historian of Brazil described the scope of their activities, they were ‘content to go grazing along the sea like crabs.’

Other European sources offer rich testimonies of the difficulties encountered when trying to make sense of the customs and habits of the Indians. Chroniclers came there equipped with a rich understanding of how the celestial bodies affected the climate of different places, why human beings and their societies displayed distinctive features in different climate zones, and how these best should be governed given the peculiarities of their natural circumstance. As Amerigo Vespucci described his voyage to Brazil in 1501, having lost sight of Ursa Minor and Ursa Major, ‘[w]e guided ourselves by the stars of the South Pole, which are numerous and much larger and brighter than those of our Pole.’ These new astrological circumstances accounted for the many strange things found in this habitat, as well as for the horrid practices of its inhabitants. As he informed Lorenzo de Medici in a letter, ‘I have


known the nature of those people, their customs, the resources and fertility of the land, the salubrity of the air, the positions of the celestial bodies in the heavens, and, above all, the fixed stars, over an eighth of the sphere, never seen by our ancestors. As he continues, "the air in this country is temperate and good, as we were able to learn from their accounts that there are never any pestilences or epidemics caused by bad air." And although the Indians lived in what appeared to be a state of natural innocence devoid of private property, rulership, and commerce, they were essentially wild, inclined to outbursts of disorderly warfare in which they mutually kill with great cruelty. They slaughter those who are captured, and the victors eat the vanquished; for human flesh is an ordinary article of food among them.

That the marvels of the New World were determined by the position of celestial bodies was equally obvious to the alchemist Richard Eden, who had translated Peter Martyr's *De orbe novo decades* (1511) into English. A cannibal kitchen on Guadeloupe could be a veritable shop of horrors, since as Martyr reported to Cardinal Sforza, "they founde likewise the heade of a yonge man fastened to a poste yet bledinge." After a short but intense battle, and when some of the cannibals had been brought into 'the Admirals shippe, they dyd no more put of their fiernes and cruell countenances, then do the Lyons of Libia...There is no man able to behowdle them, but he shall feele his bowelles grate with a certain horroure, nature hath endewed them with so terrible menacynge, and cruell aspecte.'

The appearance of naked innocence among the inhabitants of Hispaniola notwithstanding, "these naked people also are tormented with ambition for the desyre they haue to enlarge their dominions; by reason whereof they kepe warre and destroy one an other." Many of the first chronicles emphasized the wild and beastly character of the Indians but suggested few remedies beyond the use of brute force to subdue them.

---

48 Markham, *Letters of Amerigo Vespucci*, 45.
49 Markham, *Letters of Amerigo Vespucci*, 47.
50 Markham, *Letters of Amerigo Vespucci*, 47.
51 Peter Martyr, *Second Booke of the Fyrste Decade*, in Richard Eden, *The First Three English Books on America*, [1555], (Birmingham: Montague Road, 1885), 69.
52 Martyr, *Second Booke of the Fyrste Decade*, 70
Later chroniclers such as Gonzalo de Oviedo and José de Acosta were puzzled by the fact that Latin America, despite being located in the Torrid Zone, displayed a temperate climate and was more humid than could be expected. Since an excess of water was associated with phlegmatic tempers and an effeminate character, it was a short step to argue that the humidity of Spanish America made both animals and people generally weak and morally defective. As Oviedo maintained, not only were the ‘tigers’ of the New World unusually timid and cowardly, but the Indians were also by nature ‘idle and vicious, poor laborers, melancholic, cowardly, vile, ill-inclined liars with faint memory and no constancy.’ This harsh diagnosis had in a sense been written into the stars. Already the Laws of Burgos of 1512, composed when knowledge of the Indians still was scant, made ample references to their idleness and other vices. As the preamble reads, ‘it has become evident through long experience that nothing has sufficed to bring the said chiefs and Indians to a knowledge of our Faith…since by nature they are inclined to idleness and vice.’

The solution was to establish the encomienda system, which granted a conquistador the right to extract labor and tributes from the natives of a specific community provided that they were given due instruction in the Christian faith as well as protection from their enemies, a system whose inherent cruelty prompted Bartolomé de las Casas to devote a diatribe to its condemnation, which led Charles V to assemble a Junta to assess the validity of his claims.

Aristotle had provided the seed values of this kind of analysis when he argued in Politics that ‘those who live in a cold climate…are full of spirit but wanting in intelligence and skill; and therefore keep their freedom, but have no political organization, and are incapable of ruling over others. But whereas the natives of Asia are intelligent and inventive, but they are wanting in spirit, and

56 See Lesley Byrd Simpson, The Encomienda in New Spain: the beginning of Spanish Mexico, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982); Bartolomé de las Casas, Brevisima Relación de la Destrucción de las Indias, [1542], (Medellín: Imprenta Universidad de Antioquia, 2011). This issued in the Valladolid Debate (1550-1551), see Pagden, Fall of Natural Man, 109-145.
therefore they are always in a state of subjection and slavery."  

During the early stages of overseas expansion, observations like these had since long been an integral part of an erudite tradition, and eventually found their most coherent expression in Bodin’s *Methodus ad facilem historiarum cognitionem* (1566) and *Les Six livres de la République* (1576). As Bodin put it in the *Six Livres*, ‘[f]or even as we see a great variety in all sorts of beasts, and in every kind some notable alterations for the diversity of regions; in like sort we may say, there is in a manner as great difference in the nature and disposition of men, as there is of countries.’ Of the peoples of the South we learn that they are ‘cruell and reuengefull, by reason of melancholie, which doth inflame the passions of the soule with an exceeding violence, the which is not easily suppressed.’ This being so since ‘the Southerners abound in bile, which subsides like lees to the bottom when the humours have been drawn out by the heat of the sun.’ A striking example is provided by the Brazilian indians, who ‘are not contented to eat the flesh of their enemies, but will bathe the children in their blood.’ Hence it would be a grave mistake to apply the laws and forms of government suitable to the Northern or the Middle regions to the peoples of the South, because ‘[i]t is no meruaile then if the people of the South be better governed by religion, than by force or reason, the which is a point verie considerable to draw the people, when as neither force nor reason can preuaile.’ While there was ample room for disagreement as to whether the climate of the New World was predominantly moist or torrid, and whether its inhabitants were of predominantly idle or wild, there was a broad agreement to the effect that instruction in the Christian faith served the dual purpose of conversion and control. The corrupting influences of the Southern stars continued to generate commentaries for the rest of this century well into the next. For example, in his *Historia natural y moral de las Indias* (1589), José

60 Bodin, *Six Booke of a Commonweale*, V.1, 555.
de Acosta complained that his contemporaries had been wrong about the brightness of the southern stars and the climate of the New World. The stars were dimmer and the climate more temperate, and from this followed a different analysis of its inhabitants and their moral character. Although the Indians were not without religion, they had been tricked by the devil into idolatry and superstition.\textsuperscript{64} But since they did not lack judgment and understanding, they had not established barbarous or tyrannical governments among themselves but been mostly content to live in small communities devoid of sovereign authority.\textsuperscript{65} But being stuck in such a condition of childish ignorance also meant that the Indians were fair game for conversion, since ‘on their part there was much malice against God and our men, which forced them to use rigor and chastisement… yet God of his bountie hath drawne good from this evill, and hath made the subjection of the Indians, a perfect remedie for their salvation.’\textsuperscript{66}

By the end of the sixteenth century such views of the Indians had found their way into popular works of comparative ethnology and politics. In the widely read \textit{Relationi Universali} (1596) Giovanni Botero could infer from the position of the stars that ‘[s]outherne people having the greatest portion of their other humours drawne out by the heat of the Sun, the melancholike… remaine, and as dregges settle at the base of all their actions, being the more exasperated by their coward and perverse dispositions.’\textsuperscript{67} Add to this the peculiar climate of the Americas, and it was no surprise that ‘[t]he Inhabitants are of a swarthy complexion, fairer or fouler, according to their different situations. Not very well favourd, but of savage & brutish behaviours, excellent footmen and swimmers, clearly in their bodies, naked, libidinous, and men eaters.’\textsuperscript{68} The proper way to manage this combination of bodily strength and moral depravity was through the imposition of strictly organized and controlled work on the peoples of the South, something which at this point was being accomplished

\textsuperscript{64}José de Acosta, \textit{The Naturall and Morall Historie of the East and West Indies Intreating of the remarkable things of heaven, of the elements, mettalls, plants and beasts which are proper to that country: together with the manners, ceremonies, lawes, governments, and warres of the Indians}, trans. by Edward Grimeston, (London: Edward Blount and William Aspley, 1604), V, 2-6.
\textsuperscript{65}Acosta, \textit{Naturall and Morall Historie}, V, 11.
\textsuperscript{66}Acosta, \textit{Naturall and Morall Historie}, VII, 27 & 28, 583 & 589.
\textsuperscript{67}Giovanni Botero, \textit{Relations of the most famous kingdomes and common-wealths thorowout the world discoursing of their situations, religions, languages, manners, customes, strengths, greatnesse, and policies}. (London: John Hauiland, 1630), 14.
\textsuperscript{68}Botero, \textit{Relations of the most famous kingdoms}, 627.
with great determination in Spanish America. As the colonial administrator Juan de Solórzano argued in his *Politica Indiana* (1647), the Spanish crown should emulate the tyrannical policies of the Incas and Montezuma, who had known how to keep the Indians busy at all times: ‘even in the absence of profitable occupations, they worked in others of no use and benefit, even gathering lice in satchels, cutting rocks of immense size, paving valleys and roads, and building in them very sumptuous inns.’ But as Esguerra has shown in detail, these negative characterizations of the celestial constellations of the New World and their sublunary influences did not go down too well with Creole settlers, since it would follow that they would sooner or later take on the same negative traits by virtue of inhabiting the same region as the Indians. Thus, according to the missionary Bernanbe Cobo, the strongest argument against the influence of climate, is ‘that the Spaniards who live here do not slowly lose their color and take on that of the Indians, which inescapably would have to be the consequence if…the characteristics of the land determined the color of the natives.’ So in an elaborate defense of their virtue and valor, Creole elites developed their own brand of patriotic astrology that made it possible to blame the idleness of the Indians on their bodily characteristics rather than on differences of climate, thereby marking the birth of ‘scientific’ racism.

Stars of empire

The terms in which Iberian overseas expansion was understood by contemporaries owed very little to the emergent scientific worldview of the day but all the more to a received tradition of medieval and renaissance knowledge in which the then inseparable enterprises astronomy and astrology occupied center stage. Detailed knowledge of celestial bodies and their positions was necessary to navigate the oceans and get to foreign shores, while knowledge of their symbolic

---

71 Esguerra, ‘New World, New Stars’, 49-68.
meaning and influences was necessary to make sense of the strange plants, animals, and peoples found on these shores. Iberian empires were established by means of that peculiar form of knowledge, and it was evident that these changes in empire were enough to refute Copernicus even though it was *his* terraqueous globe whose waterways had been opened navigation and mastery by a generation of Iberian cosmographers and cartographers. Hence the conquest of America took place in the interstices of a geocentric and heliocentric worldview in that brief interlude when the Copernican revolution still was under challenge. Overseas expansion was therefore less a result of early scientific achievements and more motivated and facilitated by beliefs that were borderline heretic in their own day and soon would be cast aside as superstitious once the former had triumphed over its renaissance competitors.

This underlying worldview also goes some way to explain how systematic violence became embedded in colonial institutions such as the *encomienda* in early Spanish America. Celestial constellations and conditions of climate dictated that the Indians were either of a melancholic or phlegmatic disposition and therefore unlikely to respond well to the modes of governance suitable to peoples of the northern or middle regions of the earth. Quite irrespective of whether the Indians were deemed wild or idle, a combination of hard regimented labor and religious instruction would not only render them docile laborers in the service of an extractive imperial economy, but also pave way for their conversion and final redemption in afterlife. But this was not so much a matter of othering in the sense that it helped to constitute European sameness in the process, but rather a matter of assimilating the Indians into a preordained and universal scheme of classification into which all beasts and human beings could be neatly fit.\textsuperscript{72} Nor had this much to do with the Iberians becoming modern, but all the more with a successful export of an essentially medieval mindset to a continent whose subsequent fate it would thereby seal.

\textsuperscript{72} Compare Todorov, *Conquest of America*, 1-3.